EXHIBIT A

CHARGE OF DISCRIMINATION		AGENCY		CHAR	GE MIMBER	
This form in effected by the Palency Act of 1974; its Palency Act Superiors before completing the field.		•			350 A2	,00467
And the state of t						ew eroc
	Smalle					
NAMERICAN ME. AM. MASS	,		MOVE TOLETHOM Control Area Codes			
Mr. Jose A. Parra			(602) 27	0 4 × 20	10/	
The ADOMESS- 2026 North 50th Drive.	City. State and op cool Phoenix. Az 85	035		Date of Emtre 3–30–59		
NAMED IS THE EMPLOYER, LABOR ORGA	NZATION, BUPLOYMĖNI AGENC	TV. AFF	NENTICESHIP COI		ice state on le	ICAL GOVERNAGRIT
AGENCY WHO DISCRIBINATED AGAINST	A CONTRACTOR OF THE PARTY OF TH	September 10		mai je matery		
NAME TO THE TOTAL PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY OF	NUMBER OF GAPLOYEES. MEM			,	TELOTIONS DE	
Bashas', Inc.		no		mani e transcri	(480) 895	The same of the sa
STREET ADDRESS P.O. Box 488	city. State and 20° cobi Chandler, AZ	o 8524	A			CONMIA
	CHAIRS OF 1 170	V-267				
NAME			Leth-Mons light	wish o	braksijo Areu Cesis	9
STREET ADDRESS	CITY. STATE AND ZIP CODE	E				COUNTY .
CAUSE OF DISCRIMINATION BASED ON A	Charle appropriate boutest!			CAT	E CASCINAMATIO	
Y dans		-ea [and the same of th	- 1	<i>Jest (Aden/Pa)</i> Von	m To round
7/46/VI						
CONTINUENS ACTION			ng action ,			
THE PARTICULARS ARE IN additional paper is needed, effect area shouldly						
I am a Hispanic male. I was supployed by Megafoods as a journeyman meatcutter when the store was						
acquired by Bashas', Inc. and made a Food City store. Bashas' employed me'as a journeyman meatcutter, and I						
continue in that position today.						
As an employee of Bashas', Inc., I believe I have been discriminated against because of my race.						
As an employee of Bashas', mc., to believe a have deal discriminated against decause of my face, Hispanic, and my national origin, Mexican-American with respect to pay, assignment and working conditions.						
resolutions of the real masses of the control of th						
Bashas', Inc. operates food stores under the names of Bashas' and Food City, among others. Although						
the job I perform for Bashas' at a Food City, journeyman meatcumer, is the same job performed by others at						
Bashas', I was, until recently, paid less than these similarly situated employees assigned to Bashas'. I believe that this inequity in pay is because of my race, Hispanic, and my national origin, Mexican-American.						
that this inequity in pay is be	eause of my race, Hispanic	c, and	my national o	cign	, Mexican-Am	etican.
(Continued on attached)						
		·	4		•	
Research of the Second Stand with books the SEO	C and the State of Intel Acester.	L NOTA	167 - (Vihon mosci	sayy f	or Super and Local	Rechiments
I want take change that with both the SEOC and the SEOs or local Agency, ' I' any, I will exhibit the agencies I' I energie my address or takephone			The state of the s	: !		
number and I will cooperate fully with trium in the processing of my change in secondance with their processives.		I sweet or either that I have read the above charge and that it is two to the bast of my freezietys, intermedian and belot.				
		Senature of Comparing, Intermeden and David.				
a comment of the boundary of the board of th	NO	1		- manifestation	-	
9-26-01	on M. Vary			drža t	o botore me thi	ş date
Date Charging Pa	rts (Signaliano)	i isoy, i	and, and you	1	,	•
orase.		1				

Jose A. Parra Attachment to Charge of Discrmination

The working conditions at Food City are inferior to the working conditions at the other stores owned and operated by Bashas', Inc. The equipment at Food City that I am required to use is old and not maintained well. The store is often not maintained in a clean or sanitary manner. I believe Bashas' is kept in a better condition, with more modern equipment and in a cleaner condition. I believe that I have been assigned to work under these conditions because of my race, Hispanic, and my national origin, Mexican-American.

I bring this charge on behalf of myself and similarly-situated Hispanic employees, and employees who are of Mexican or Mexican-American national origin, who I believe receive or received less pay and poorer assignments than white employees.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Jose A. Pars

9-26-01

Date

EXHIBIT B

Case, 2:02-cv-00591-RCB Document 281-2 Filed 02/25/09 Page 5 of 29 (Test 10/94) UNI_LD STATES OF AME_ICA

EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION

SUBPOENA

TO:	Julie Sanford BASHA'S PO Box 488 Chandlett, Anzona 8	35244			NO. PH	X-06-32	
in the	Matter of:	Jose A. Parra, Gonzalo Estrada, and Jose Estrada Perez	Gloria Arria;	ga. Maricruz Rivera, Ju Charg		Maria Gutietrez, (Sea Exhibit A	·
Having f		ious request(s) made by or on beha	alf of the unde				
Te	estify before:	X Produce and bri	ng e or	X Mail® the do	ocuments des	cribed below to:	
X Pr	roduce access to the evider	nce described below for the purpos	e of examina	tion or copying to:			
Roberto	Rivera, Jr., Investigator			of the Equal	Employment	Opportunity Con	rmission
at 33	300 N. Central Ave. Suite	690, Phoenix, AZ 85012	Oth	May 30, 2006	ង្ស	2:00 p.m.	o'clock
The evid	lence required is libit A.						
							SESSE SESSE
This sub	opoena is issued pursuant !	<u> </u>	7000±-9 (ADA) 42 U S.C	(ADBA) 29 U S (J. 626(a§	(EPA) 29	U 5 C 209
	G OFFICIAL (Typed name		он в	EHALF OF THE COM	AOISSIMI		
/ 3300 N.	V. Bailey, District Directo Central Ave., Suite 690 , Arizona 85012-1848	or	Δ	usanh k	us	MAY 1 1 20	
*NOTIC	E TO PERSON SUBPOE	NAED - The Commission will not	pay witness	ees or travel expenses	for the deliver	y of required doc	uments Mar Ta

Commission office unless the box "Testify before" is also checked on the subpoena.

Attachment to Subpoena No. PHX-06-32

EEOC Charge Nos. 350-A2-00467, 350-A2-00466, 350-A2-00464, 350-A2-00462, 350-A2-00463, 350-A2-00465, 350-A2-00468 and 350-A2-00031

EXHIBIT A

- 1. Produce all pay scales in effect for any hourly position at Basha's, Inc. stores operated under the name "Basha's" from 1998 to the present.
- 2. Produce all pay scales in effect for any hourly position at Basha's, Inc. stores operated under the name "A.J.'s" from 1998 to the present.
- 3. Produce all pay scales in effect for any hourly position at Basha's, Inc. stores operated under the name "Food City" from 1998 to the present.
- 4 Produce all policies, procedures, collective bargaining agreements and documents pertaining to the establishment of pay scales for hourly positions at Basha's, Food City, and A.J.'s from 1998 to the present.
- 5. Produce all meeting minutes or notes discussing the pay scales for Basha's, Food City, or A.J.'s from 1998 to the present.
- 6. Produce the personnel files for Jose A. Parra, Gonzalo Estrada, Gloria Arriaga, Maricruz Rivera, Juana Urbina, Maria Gutierrez, Carmen Lopez and Jose Estrada Perez.
- 7. Produce all documents or materials reflecting the racial and national origin composition of hourly employees at all Basha's, Food City, and A.J.'s stores in the State of Arizona for all years starting in 1998 to the present, including all EEO-1 Reports.

MAY 1 1 2006

Date

Chester V. Bailey, District Director

Quesar & Muce

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

3300 N. Central Avenue Suite 690

Phoenix, AZ 85012-9688

Page 2 of 2



EXHIBIT C



U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION Phoenix District Office

3300 N. Central Avenue, Suite 690 Phoenix, AZ 85012-2504 (602) 640-5000 TTY (602) 640-5072

FAX (602) 640-5071

Jane Daniel Land SEP 1 3 2006

September 12, 2006

Stephanie J. Quincy, Esq. Sherman & Howard, L.L.C. 1850 North Central Avenue, Ste. 500 Phoenix, Arizona 85004

Jose A. Parra v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00467) Re: Gonzalo Estrada v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00466) Gloria Arriaga v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00464) Maricruz Rivera v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00462) Juana Urbina v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00463) Maria Gutierrez v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-90465) Carmen Lopez v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00468) Jose Estrada Perez v. Bashas, Inc. (EEOC Charge No.: 350-A2-00031)

Dear Esq. Quincy:

This letter is to notify you that the above referenced charges have been re-opened pursuant to EEOC Procedural Regulations Section 29, CFR 1601.28a (3). EEOC will now continue to process these charges.

Once we have completed our investigations, a determination will be assued and you will be so notified.

If you have any questions, please contact Investigator Roberto Rivera, Jr., at your convenience at (602) 640-5065.

Chester V. Bailev

District Director

EXHIBIT D



U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION Washington, D.C. 20507

Office of the Vice Chair

COMMISSIONER'S CHARGE

Pursuant to the authority contained in Sections 706 and 707 of Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, as amended, 42 U.S.C.§2000e ("Title VII"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 2000e-5 and 2000e-6, and 29 C.F.R. § 1601.11, I issue this Commissioner's Charge against the following employer:

Bashas' Inc. P. O. Box 488 Chandler, AZ 85244

I believe that the above employer is within the jurisdiction of the United States Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Further, I have reason to believe that the above employer has, since at least May 2004, violated Title VII by discriminating against Hispanics due to their national origin. This discriminatory activity includes, but is not limited to, failing to pay Hispanic employees comparable wages to non-Hispanic employees and failing to promote Hispanics into Management positions.

The persons aggrieved include all persons who have been adversely affected by the above unlawful practices.

I, Leslie E. Silverman, Commissioner, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, true and correct.

Executed on this 9 day of May 2007.

Leslie E. Silverman

Commissioner

U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

EXHIBIT E



U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION Phoenix District Office 3300 N

3300 N Central Avenue, Suite 600 Phoenix, AZ 85012-2504 (202) 640-5000 4 FY (602) 640-5072 FAX (602) 640-5071

December 6, 2007

Stephanie Quincy Steptoe & Johnson 201 E Washington Street, Ste., 1600 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2382

Dear Ms. Quincy;

Your description of Bashas Inc.'s automated records has been reviewed. The response was inadequate. For example, it failed to specify, as requested, "the name and commonly understood description of each field or variable on the file". It also failed to provide the "definition of all codes used in the file." However, in order to proceed in a timely manner we are, at this time, requesting some of the data that you described. This does not preclude us from requiring additional data or documentation as the investigation proceeds. The description provided lists in a large number of data files. This list is provided with no explanation and includes a number of files that appear to be redundant.

Our initial request for a detailed description of the files is intended to minimize the burden of providing such information. The failure to fully comply forces us to impose the additional requirements. First, the data provided must cover all of Bashas employees over the past five years with a variable indicating whether or not the employee is currently active. An indication of active employees is normally captured in a variable called STATUS or something similar. Second, the data must include each employee's race and ethnicity. Third, each file provided must include a unique identifier for each employer that serves as a key variable that allows the linking of the different files. While, this type of variable is often a social security number, we are asking that if possible, an alternative employee identification number to be used as an additional safeguard of employee privacy. Fourth, the data files must be structured so that the rows represent employees and the columns represent information about the employee. Each row must contain the employee identification variable. The requested files are listed below; these titles are derived from the column labeled "Description". These descriptions are often repeated in the list you provided without explanation. The data provided must be comprehensive for the all files matching the "Description".

- EMPLOYEE EDUCATION FILE
- EMPLOYEE INCOME FILE
- EMPLOYEE MASTER AUDIT FILE FOR TM

- EMPLOYEE MULTIPLE POSITION FILE
- EMPLOYEE NUMBER CHANGE HISTORY
- EMPLOYEE OJT EDUCATION FILE
- EMPLOYEE PAYROLL MASTER FILE(S)
- EMPLOYEE PERSONNEL MASTER FILE(S)
- EMPLOYEE ROOT MASTER FILE(S)
- EMPLOYEE SUPERVISOR FILE
- PERSONNEL ACTIONS HISTORY FILE
- EMPLOYEE POSITION SCORE
- PREVIOUS EMPLOYMENT HISTORY
- DISCRIMINATION TESTING EMPLOYEE RANKING WORKFILE
- EMPLOYEE COURSES TAKEN
- HAY JOB EVALUATION FILE
- SUMMARIZED HISTORY INCOME FILE(S)

The data should be provided on compact disk. It may be written in one of the following formats: Excel, Quattro Pro, dBase, Fox Pro, Paradox, Access or ASCII delimited ("csv"). Other formats may be acceptable if approved by the EEOC prior to submission. Regardless of format, we ask that the first row consist of the field or variable names. Compact disks should be clearly labeled to identify the contents. If possible, please print out some of the records, preferably the first 25 observations from each file. A one-page sample of each of the files should be printed and provided. Detailed documentation, explaining all data fields, must be provided. It is acceptable to make this part of the data bases provided. It is also necessary for you to provide a definition of all codes used in the file. (This was requested previously, but not provided.) For example if "M" is used to designate "male" that needs to be specified. This documentation should be provided in an Excel format. If that is not possible, other formats may be acceptable if approved by the EEOC prior to submission.

Finally, Bashas' must produce the following paper records: three complete personnel records retained by the company. This will enable us to make certain that we have successfully converted the automated data.

Please respond by January 7, 2008.

Sincerely,

160

Charles Rahill Investigator

(602) 640-5068

EXHIBIT F



U.S. EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION Phoenix District Office

3300 N. Central Avenue, Suite 690 Phoenix, AZ 85012-2504 (602) 640-5000 TTY (602) 640-5071 FAX (602) 640-5071

February 21, 2008

Stephanie Quincy Steptoe & Johnson 201 E Washington Street, Ste., 1600 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2382

Dear Ms. Quincy:

Your January 8, 2008 description of Bashas Inc.'s automated records has been reviewed. Please provide the data listed in the appendix that follows. To address your concerns regarding over broad data requests we have attempted to restrict the data requested as much as possible. This does not preclude us from requiring additional data or documentation as the investigation proceeds.

The requests may cover some areas that you might consider irrelevant for two reasons. First, due to an inadequate description of the variables we lack a complete understanding of them. (While your response appears to list variables or fields in the data sets it failed to provide a "commonly understood description of each field or variable on the file". It also failed to provide the "definition of all codes used in the file.") Second, Basha's system appears to be an "off the shelf" system from Infinium. It is possible that Basha's does not use all of the fields or variables included in this system. If that is the case for a requested variable please provide an indication of that. As mentioned above, not all data fields are being requested. However, if you prefer to provide all fields to reduce processing time, that is acceptable. However please redact social security numbers unless it is the sole unique identifier for an employee. Also note that only those date variables described as "8 DIGIT" are requested. Since the documentation was scant, it is assumed that these dates indicate, month, day and year. If this assumption is not correct, please provide for each requested type of date, the format meeting this condition.

The data should be provided on compact disk. It may be written in one of the following formats: Excel, Access or ASCII delimited ("csv"). Other formats may be acceptable if approved by the EEOC prior to submission. Regardless of format, EEOC asks that the first row consist of the field or variable names with subsequent rows for employee observations without blanks or repeating variable names or titles. There should be one column for each variable requested.

For each of the tables (files) produced, provide a definition of each of the fields of information on each record. Also, for each variable or field of information that contains a code to capture the value of the field, please define that code. For example, if "M" is in the field of information called "SEX OF EMPLOYEE," indicate what "M" means. Perhaps, "M" equals "male". These variable and code definitions must be provided in an EXCEL or WORD format or a format approved by the EEOC prior to submission.

The compact disks should be clearly labeled to identify the contents. If possible, please print out some of the records, preferably the first 25 observations from each file. For each compact disk, a paper copy of the directory should be included, indicating the names of the database files, the number of bytes contained in each file, and a log of any queries used to export or import the data. If a computer file requires more than one compact disk, the data should be provided in a manner that does not require that the disks be restored in a particular order. Finally, please provide at least two complete "hard copy" personnel files or print screens for employees (or applicants) who have records on the files that you are providing. This will enable us to make certain that we have successfully converted the automated data.

APPENDIX

EMPLOYEE MASTER FILE

FIELD	FIELD DESCRIPTION
PEER	EMPLOYER NUMBER
PEEN	EMPLOYEE NUMBER
PEPLVL	ORGANIZATIONAL LEVEL
PELNM	EMPLOYEE LAST NAME
PEFIT	EMPLOYEE FIRST INIT
PEPPOS	POSITION
PEPNM	PREVIOUS NAME
PEPJB8	LAST JOB CHANGE DATE-8 DIGIT
PEPL01	PREVIOUS LEVEL 1
PEPL02	PREVIOUS LEVEL 2
PEPL03	PREVIOUS LEVEL 3
PEPL04	PREVIOUS LEVEL 4
PEPDD8	LAST LEVEL CHAGNE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PEDOD8	DATE OF DEATH-8 DIGIT
PEPPPO	PREVIOUS POSITION

EMPLOYEE NUMBER CHANGE HISTORY

EITHER ALL VARIABLES OR STIPUTLATION THAT THERE ARE NO CHANGES TO EMPLOYEE NUMBER CONTINUED

```
EMPLOYEE ROOT MASTER FILE
FIELD
          FIELD DESCRIPTION
PRER
          EMPLOYER NUMBER
PREN
          EMPLOYEE NUMBER
PRL01
          LEVEL 1
PRL02
          LEVEL 2
PRL03
          LEVEL 3
PRL04
          LEVEL 4
PRLNM
          NAME - LAST
PRFNM
          NAME - FIRST
PRMNM
          NAME - MIDDLE INITIAL
PRSTR1
          ADDRESS - STREET LINE 1
PRSTR2
          ADDRESS - STREET LINE 2
PRCTY1
          ADDRESS - CITY
PRSTA1
          ADDRESS - STATE
PRSZIP1
          ADDRESS - POSTAL CODE
PRDOB8
          DATE OF BIRTH - 8 DIGIT
PRSEX
          SEX OF EMPLOYEE
PRETH
          ETHNIC ID
PREDU
          EDUCATION
PRCLN
          CLOCK NUMBER
PRDOH8
          DATE OF HIRE - 8 DIGIT
PRDHA8
          ADJUSTED DATE OF HIRE - 8 DIGIT
PREEO
          EEO CATEGORY
PRCLA
          CLASS
PRSTAT
          STATUS CODE
PRLOC
          LOCATION CODE
PRLAC
          LABOR CATEGORY
PRPOS
          POSITION
PRJOB1
          JOB CODE 1
PRJOB2
          JOB CODE 2
PRJOB3
          JOB CODE 3
PRSR18
          SENIORITY DATE 1 - 8 DIGIT
PRSR28
          SENIORITY DATE 2 - 8 DIGIT
PRSR38
          SENIORITY DATE 3 - 8 DIGIT
PRTITL
          POSITION TITLE
PRSFT
          USER SHIFT FIELD
PRWCC
          WORKMAN EMPL CODE
PRWCN
          WORKMAN EMPL NUMBER
PRUCD
          UNION CODE
PRUID
          UNION ID NUMBER
PRLVC
          LEAVE CODE
          LEAVE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRLVD8
PRRLV8
          EXPECTED RETURN FROM LEAVE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRLBRK
          LENGTH OF SERVICE BREAK
PRTEC
          TERMINATION CODE
PRTED8
          TERMINATION DATE - 8 DIGIT
```

CONTINUED

PRPURG	KEEP PERMANENTLY
PRREC	REHIRE ELIGIBILITY CODE
PRREH8	REHIRE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRRHR	HOURS REGULARLY WORKED

PRINF PAY FREQUENCY
PRSRG SALARY RANGE
PRBRT BASE PAY RATE
PRPAY PAY TYPE H-S

PRBRTF BASE RATE FREQUENCY

PRPGR PAY GRADE CODE PRPSTA PREVIOUS STATUS

PRSCH8 STATUS CHANGE DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRPR PREVIOUS RATE

PRLRC8 DATE LAST RATE CHANGE - 8 DIGIT

PRLAMT LAST INCREASE AMOUNT
PRLPER LAST INCREASE PERCENT
PRRSN LAST SALARY CHANGE REASON

PRPRAT PERFORMANCE RATING
PRNRV8 NEXT REVIEW DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRNRVT NEXT REVIEW TYPE CODE

PREFF8 EFFECTIVE DATE OF SALARY INCREASE - 8 DIGIT

PRRET RETIREMENT AGE
PRPPLNM PREVIOUS NAME
PRCOMP COMP RATIO

PRLDW8 LAST WORKED DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRLAYO LAYOFF FLAG
PRPROM PROMOTION CODE
PRRVSC RATING SCORE

PRPGR8 PAY GRADE DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRSTP STEP-IN-GRADE
PRSTP8 STEP DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRSTPI FREEZE STEP

PRNSP8 NEXT STEP DATE - 8 DIGIT PRNSPO NEXT STEP OVERRIDE

PRNIC8 NEXT INCREASE DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRCSPT SHIFT CODE

PRUEL8 UNION ELIGIBILITY DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRSTGP CAN EEO OCC. GRP.
PRTGRP TRAINING GROUP
PRAFFH EFFECTIVE DATE

SUMMARIZED HISTORY INCOME FILE

ALL VARIABLES

CONTINUED

EMPLOYEE PAYROLL MASTER FILE

FIELD DESCRIPTION
PYER EMPLOYER NUMBER
PYEN EMPLOYEE NUMBER
PYYBAS ANNUAL WAGE BASE

PYCYC CYCLE CODE

PYPGRS GROSS PAY LAST YEAR

PYGRS GROSS PAY YTD PYNET NET PAY YTD PYBRT PAY RATE - 1ST PYBRT2 PAY RATE - 2ND PYBRT3 PAY RATE - 3RD **PYMTYP** PAY RATE BASIS **PYMFAC** MULTIPLIER FACTOR **PYMNAM** MULTIPLIER NAME PYMCOL MULTIPLIER COLUMN **PYMROW MULTIPLIER ROW**

PYPAYT PAY AFTER TERMINATION PYPAYL PAY WHILE ON LEAVE

PYWW0 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 0
PYWW1 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 1
PYWW2 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 2
PYWW3 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 3
PYWW4 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 4
PYPWAG GROSS WAGES LAST YEAR

PYWAGE GROSS WAGES YTD PYPHRS HOURS LAST YEAR

PYHRS HOURS YTD

EMPLOYEE INCOME FILE

NO DATA REQUESTED AT THIS TIME BUT RESERVE RIGHT TO REQUEST DATA AT A LATER DATE

Please respond by March 14, 2008.

Che Reduce

Sincerely,

Charles Rahill Investigator

(602) 640-5068

EXHIBIT G

Case 2:02-cv-00591-RCB Document 281-2 Filed 02/25/09 Page 21 of 29

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LIP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

Srephanie J. Quincy 602.257.5230 squincy@steptoe.com

Elizabeth A. Schallop Call 602.27.5208 bcall@steptoe.com Collier Center 201 East Washington Street Suite 1600 Phoenix, AZ 85004-2382 Tel 602.257.5200 Fax 602.257 5299 steptoe.com

March 14, 2008

VIA FAX AND U.S. MAIL

Charles J. Rahill Investigator U. S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission 3300 North Central Avenue Suite 690 Phoenix, Arizona 85012

Re: EEOC v. Bashas' Inc.

Charge No. 540-2007-03122

Dear Mr. Rahill:

We received the Commission's February 21, 2008 Request for Information ("Request") in connection with the above-referenced Charge. This letter constitutes Bashas' Inc.'s response to your Request.

While you explain that "[I]he requests may cover some areas that you might consider irrelevant for two reasons," Bashas' remains unable to examine let alone determine the relevancy of any request because the Commission has not yet provided the company with sufficient notice of the basis of this Charge or this Request. See 29 C.F.R. § 1601.12(a) (3); EEOC v. Shell Oil Co., 466 U.S. 54, 72-73 (1984). Once the Commission provides Bashas' with the specific information as to the basis of this Charge and this Request required by the statutory notice requirements, Bashas' will be able to evaluate what constitutes the relevant data and other documentation responsive to the Commission's Request. Shell Oil, 466 U.S. at 64 (holding that EEOC's investigative authority is not plenary; it is entitled only to evidence relevant to the charge under investigation); EEOC v. United Airlines, 287 F.3d 643, 652 ("[T]he Commission is entitled to access only to evidence 'relevant' to the charge under investigation."); EEOC v. Ford Motor Credit Co., 26 F.3d 44, 47 (6th Cir. 1994) (rejecting the notion that the EEOC is entitled to any material that it deems relevant in its discretion). The Commission's refusal to do so deprives Bashas' of any meaningful manner to object to the Request.

More specifically, your February 21, 2008 Request does not specify the employees or the time period for which you seek the data and information. The Commission has not responded to our concern

Doc. #552627 v.1

Charles Rahill March 14, 2008 Page 2

STEPTOE & JOHNSON LE

with the December 6, 2007 Request for data for all Bashas' employees over the past five years. On this basis alone, the Request is overly broad and unduly burdensome.

Additionally, the following requested data fields are not used or inconsistently populated, or contain data automatically supplied by the system which is not uniformly consistent for all employees:

- Employee Master File: Organizational Level;
- Employee Root Master File: Education (contains data from 2006 forward), Clock Number, Job Code 2, Job Code 3, Seniority Date 1, Seniority Date 2, Seniority Date 3, User Shift Field, Workman Empl Number, Union Code, Union ID Number, Length of Service Break, Keep Permanently, Rehire Eligibility Code, Hours Regularly Worked, Pay Grade Code, Performance Rating, Next Review Date, Next Review Type Code, Retirement Age, Comp Ratio, Layoff Flag, Promotion Code, Rating Score, Pay Grade Date, Step-In-Grade, Step Date, Freeze Step, Next Step Date, Next Step Override, Next Increase Date, Shift Code, Union Eligibility Date, Can EEO Occ. Grp., Training Group and Effective Date; and
- Employee Payroll Master File: Annual Wage Base, Pay Rate 2nd, Pay Rate 3rd, Pay Rate Basis, Multiplier Factor, Multiplier Name, Multiplier Column, Multiplier Row, Pay While on Leave, Weeks Worked Quarter 0, Weeks Worked Quarter 1, Weeks Worked Quarter 2, Weeks Worked Quarter 3 and Weeks Worked Quarter 4.

Furthermore, the Commission's request for "at least two complete 'hard copy' personnel files or print screens for employees (or applicants) who have records on the files that you are providing" is both overly broad and ambiguous. It is our understanding based on the minimal information provided to date that this Charge pertains to compensation and promotion allegations. Therefore, it is unclear why applicant data would be relevant to this inquiry. Second, the Commission provides no explanation as to why it requires multiple copies of the same files in response to this Request. Surely, a single copy of each file will adequately allow the Commission to complete its verification process. Nonetheless, Bashas' will not produce any electronic data or hard copy files until an appropriate confidentiality agreement is executed.

Finally, we have grave concerns about where any information shared with the EEOC will go. For example, in a deposition in *Parra*, et al v. Bashas, the attorney for the class, Jocelyn Larkin, demonstrated that she was aware of a charge of discrimination then being investigated by the EEOC.

¹ Bashas' objected to the December 6, 2007 Request for Information relating to those former Bashas' employees, who were not employed at the time that this Charge was filed on May 17, 2008. See Dukes v. Wal-Mart, Inc., No. 04-16688 (9th Cir. 2007) (holding in a plaintiff's class action suit under Title VII, those putative class members who were no longer employees at the time plaintiff's complaint was filed do not have standing to pursue relief).

Charles Rahill March 14, 2008 Page 2 STEPTOE & JOHNSON UP

The EEOC had not yet filed suit against Bashas' on the charge and Ms. Larkin was not involved in the charge or representing the charging parties. Nonetheless, her questions demonstrated knowledge of the charge, in violation of federal law. Ms. Larkin's co-counsel on the case, Davis, Cowell and Bowe, represents the United Food and Commercial Worker's Union. As you may know, the UFCW is involved in a vicious smear campaign against Bashas'. To the extent any information is shared with either of these outside entities, we have serious concerns and our prior requests for assurances have not been sufficiently addressed.

As the specific information requested includes confidential employee information, to the extent that Bashas' would be willing to provide this confidential employee information, it will do so only pursuant to a confidentiality agreement. We have enclosed a proposed confidentiality agreement for your review.

In prior letters, we have discussed our concern that this charge is being used as a vehicle to relitigate the *Parra* case after an adverse ruling. In light of this, we request assurances from your agency that the EEOC will not be used as a tool to circumvent the Rules of Civil Procedure. Enclosed is a confidentiality order which would address and resolve this issue.

We are hopeful that the Commission will recognize both its obligations to provide sufficient information to the company regarding the underlying allegations prompting this significant request and Bashas' interest in maintaining the confidentiality of any information produced in relation to this Charge given the rather unusual circumstances. However, if we are unable to reach an agreement on these issues, as we have stated previously, Bashas' will no choice but to leave this determination for a court.

We look forward to your response to our concerns. Please contact me at 602.257.5230 if you would like to discuss this further.

Regards.

Stephanie J. Quincy

Elizabeth A. Schallop Call

EXHIBIT H

Case 2:02-cv-00591-RCB Document 281-2 Filed 02/25/09 Page 25 of 29

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

EQUAL EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION

SUBPOENA

TO:	Edward N. Bashs	Jr., Chairman and CEC)		NO.	PHX-08-24	3
	Bashas' Inc.	en 1 th and	,				
	P. O. Box 488						
	Chandler, AZ 8524	84					
IN THE MA	TTER OF:	Vice Chair Silverman	v. Bashas' Inc.				
				Cha	irge No.	540-2007-0	3122
YOU ARE H	IEREBY REQUIRED	AND DIRECTED TO:					
Testif	y before:	Produce	and bring * or	X Mail * the	documents (described bel	low to:
Produ	co access to the ev	vidence described belov	w for the purpos	e of examination c	or copying to	:	
Charles Rai	nilli, investigator (60	2) 640-5068		of the Equ	al Employme	nt Opportuni	ty Commission
at 3300 N	lorth Central Ave.,	Ste 690, Phoenix, AZ 95	5012 on	June 13, 2008	æt	4:00	oʻclock
	e required is	daaciba samattiida s	alao ta ar calata i	lan samas enemas dan dibasa di	n li assa limon		
Ali me docu	menis wiich sizio,	describe, constitute, re	siet to ot telate i	iu suà maà 10 me m	วเเดลเนติ		
cc: Stephanl							
	ā Johnson Washington						
Sulte 160	10						
Phoenix.	AZ 85004-2382						
This subpool	na is Issued pursua	ang X (Title VII) 42 U	1.S.C. 2000e-9 [(ADEA) 28 U.S.(3, 820(a) [(EPA) 29	U.S.C.209
		(m)	- (ribry 14 516)6. I	(-)			
ISSUING OFF	FICIAL (Typed name	, title and address)	ON BE	HALF OF THE CO	MMISSION		
	alley, District Direct						
	nix District Directo al Avenue – Ste 690		Ame	. I va	maran.	- haln	P
Phoenix, AZ (V/a	NOVO	· _	3 /20/ (1)	,
						Date	

"NOTICE TO PERSON SUBPOENAED - The Commission will not pay witness fees or travel expenses for the delivery of required documents to a Commission office unless the box "Testify before" is also checked on the subpoena.

Attachment to Subpoena No. PHX-08-24 In Charge Number: 540-2007-03122

1. Provide the electronic or computerized data listed in the appendix that follows. The data request is for the period May I, 2004 to present date.

Please redact social security numbers unless it is the sole unique identifier for an employee. Also note that only those date variables described as "8 DIGIT" are requested. It is assumed that these dates indicate, month, day and year. If this assumption is not correct, please provide for each requested type of date, the format meeting this condition.

The data should be provided on compact disk. It may be written in one of the following formats: Excel, Access or ASCII delimited ("csv"). Other formats may be acceptable if approved by the EEOC prior to submission. Regardless of format, EEOC asks that the first row consist of the field or variable names with subsequent rows for employee observations without blanks or repeating variable names or titles. There should be one column for each variable requested.

- 2. The compact disks should be clearly labeled to identify the contents. If possible, please print out some of the records, preferably the first 25 observations from each file. For each compact disk, a paper copy of the directory should be included, indicating the names of the database files, the number of bytes contained in each file, and a log of any queries used to export or import the data. If a computer file requires more than one compact disk, the data should be provided in a manner that does not require that the disks be restored in a particular order.
- 3. For each of the tables (files) produced, provide a definition of each of the fields of information on each record. Also, for each variable or field of information that contains a code to capture the value of the field, please define that code. For example, if "M" is in the field of information called "SEX OF EMPLOYEE," indicate what "M" means. Perhaps, "M" equals "male". These variable and code definitions must be provided in an EXCEL or WORD format or a format approved by the EEOC prior to submission.
- 4. Please provide at least two complete "hard copy" personnel files of print screens for employees (or applicants) who have records on the files that you are providing. This will enable us to make certain that we have successfully converted the automated data.

Date '

128/98

Chester V. Bailey

District Director

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission 3300 North Central Ave., Ste. 690

Phoenix, AZ 85012

APPENDIX

EMPLOYEE MASTER FILE

FIELD	FIELD DESCRIPTION
PEER	EMPLOYER NUMBER
PEEN	EMPLOYEE NUMBER
PEPLVL	ORGANIZATIONAL LEVEL
PELNM	EMPLOYEE LAST NAME
PEFIT	EMPLOYEE FIRST INIT
PEPPO\$	POSITION
PEPNM	PREVIOUS NAME
PEPJB8	LAST JOB CHANGE DATE-8 DIGIT
PEPL01	PREVIOUS LEVEL 1
PEPL02	PREVIOUS LEVEL 2
PEPL03	PREVIOUS LEVEL 3
PEPL04	PREVIOUS LEVEL 4
PEPDD8	LAST LEVEL CHAGNE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PEDOD8	DATE OF DEATH-8 DIGIT

EMPLOYEE NUMBER CHANGE HISTORY

PEPPPO PREVIOUS POSITION

EITHER ALL VARIABLES OR STIPULATION THAT THERE ARE NO CHANGES TO EMPLOYEE NUMBER

EMPLOYEE ROOT MASTER FILE

outers made a man	The state of the s
FIELD	FIELD DESCRIPTION
PRER	EMPLOYER NUMBER
PREN	EMPLOYEE NUMBER
PRL01	LEVEL 1
PRL02	LEVEL 2
PRL03	LEVEL 3
PRL04	LEVEL 4
PRLNM	NAME - LAST
PRFNM	NAME - FIRST
PRMNM	NAME - MIDDLE INITIAL
PRSTR1	ADDRESS - STREET LINE 1
PRSTR2	ADDRESS - STREET LINE 2
PRCTY1	ADDRESS - CITY
PRSTA1	ADDRESS - STATE
PRSZIP1	ADDRESS - POSTAL CODE
PRDOB8	DATE OF BIRTH - 8 DIGIT
PRSEX	SEX OF EMPLOYEE
PRETH	ETHNIC ID
PREDU	EDUCATION
PRCLN	CLOCK NUMBER
PRDOH8	DATE OF HIRE - 8 DIGIT
PRDHA8	ADJUSTED DATE OF HIRE - 8 DIGIT
PREEO	EEO CATEGORY

```
PRCLA
          CLASS
PRSTAT
          STATUS CODE
PRLOC
          LOCATION CODE
PRLAC
          LABOR CATEGORY.
PRPOS
          POSITION
PRJOB1
          JOB CODE 1
PRJOB2
          JOB CODE 2
PRJOB3
          JOB CODE 3
PRSR18
          SENIORITY DATE 1 - 8 DIGIT
PRSR28
          SENIORITY DATE 2 - 8 DIGIT
PRSR38
          SENIORITY DATE 3 - 8 DIGIT
PRTITL
          POSITION TITLE
PRSFT
         USER SHIFT FIELD
PRWCC
         WORKMAN EMPL CODE
PRWCN
         WORKMAN EMPL NUMBER
PRUCD
         UNION CODE
PRUID
         UNION ID NUMBER
PRLVC
         LEAVE CODE
PRLVD8
         LEAVE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRRLV8
         EXPECTED RETURN FROM LEAVE DATE - 8 DIGIT
         LENGTH OF SERVICE BREAK
PRLBRK
PRTEC
         TERMINATION CODE
PRTED8
         TERMINATION DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRPURG KEEP PERMANENTLY
PRREC
         REHIRE ELIGIBILITY CODE
         REHIRE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRREH8
PRRHR
         HOURS REGULARLY WORKED
PRINE
         PAY FREQUENCY
PRSRG
         SALARY RANGE
PRBRT
         BASE PAY RATE
PRPAY
         PAY TYPE H-S
PRBRTF
         BASE RATE FREQUENCY
PRPGR
         PAY GRADE CODE
PRPSTA
         PREVIOUS STATUS
PRSCH8
         STATUS CHANGE DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRPR
         PREVIOUS RATE
PRLRC8
         DATE LAST RATE CHANGE - 8 DIGIT
PRLAMT
         LAST INCREASE AMOUNT
PRLPER
         LAST INCREASE PERCENT
PRRSN
         LAST SALARY CHANGE REASON
PRPRAT
         PERFORMANCE RATING
PRNRV8
         NEXT REVIEW DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRNRVT
         NEXT REVIEW TYPE CODE
         EFFECTIVE DATE OF SALARY INCREASE - 8 DIGIT
PREFF8
PRRET
         RETIREMENT AGE
PRPPLNM PREVIOUS NAME
PRCOMP
         COMP RATIO
PRLDW8
         LAST WORKED DATE - 8 DIGIT
PRLAYO
         LAYOFF FLAG
PRPROM PROMOTION CODE
```

PRRVSC RATING SCORE

PRPGR8 PAY GRADE DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRSTP STEP-IN-GRADE PRSTP8 STEP DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRSTPI FREEZE STEP

PRNSP8 NEXT STEP DATE - 8 DIGIT PRNSPO NEXT STEP OVERRIDE

PRNIC8 NEXT INCREASE DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRCSPT SHIFT CODE

PRUEL8 UNION ELIGIBILITY DATE - 8 DIGIT

PRSTGP CAN EEO OCC. GRP.
PRTGRP TRAINING GROUP
PRAFFH EFFECTIVE DATE

SUMMARIZED HISTORY INCOME FILE

ALL VARIABLES

EMPLOYEE PAYROLL MASTER FILE

FIELD DESCRIPTION

PYER EMPLOYER NUMBER PYEN EMPLOYEE NUMBER

PYYBAS ANNUAL WAGE BASE

PYCYC CYCLE CODE

PYPGRS GROSS PAY LAST YEAR

PYGRS GROSS PAY YTD

PYNET NET PAY YTD

PYBRT PAY RATE - 1ST

PYBRT2 PAY RATE - 2ND

PYBRT3 PAY RATE - 3RD

PYMTYP PAY RATE BASIS

PYMFAC MULTIPLIER FACTOR

PYMNAM MULTIPLIER NAME

PYMCOL MULTIPLIER COLUMN

PYMROW MULTIPLIER ROW

PYPAYT PAY AFTER TERMINATION

PYPAYL PAY WHILE ON LEAVE

PYWW0 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 0

PYWW1 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 1

PYWW2 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 2

PYWW3 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 3

PYWW4 WEEKS WORKED - QUARTER 4
PYPWAG GROSS WAGES LAST YEAR

PYPWAGE GROSS WAGES LAST YEAR PYWAGE GROSS WAGES YTD

PYPHRS HOURS LAST YEAR

PYHRS HOURS YTD

EMPLOYEE INCOME FILE

NO DATA REQUESTED AT THIS TIME BUT RESERVE RIGHT TO REQUEST DATA AT A LATER DATE